



## St John's College Junior Common Room

Minutes - 4th Ordinary Meeting, Trinity Term 2020  
Friday 12 June 2020, via Zoom, 3 pm

The meeting began at 3 pm, with Zara Hussain (Vice President) chairing and Lachlann Hinley (Secretary) as minute taker. Zara introduced the format of the meeting and noted that questions could be asked via the chat.

### 1. Minutes from the Previous Meeting

Available on the website [here](#). There were no objections.

### 2. Matters Arising from the Minutes

Results of Motions (Chair)

Following the Extraordinary General Meeting held on 6 June, all motions had passed in the online ballot. Full results were available in the minutes of that meeting.

Letter to Vice Chancellor on Admissions Statistics (Phil Fernandes)

Phil Fernandes (President) said a letter to the Vice Chancellor had been sent respecting the *"Immediately Release the 2020 Admissions Statistical Report"* Standing Policy Motion. Phil had yet to receive a reply.

Phil Fernandes had consulted with Oxford SU about the statistics. The University was apparently meant to release the statistics that week; although, having failed to do so, it was expected the report would be published by the end of the month.

Motion Condemning Christ Church (Phil Fernandes)

Phil Fernandes (President) raised the issue with Maggie Snowling (College President). Maggie Snowling did not address the issue directly but listed the steps the College and University were taking to address some of the underlying issues. Phil reminded that Maggie Snowling would be holding two 'town hall-style' meetings, which may be an appropriate forum to raise the issues.

International Students E&D Rep

Alfie Deere-Hall recalled that the *"International Students E&D Rep" No Confidence Motion* obliged Stan Szelag, the former International Students E&D Rep, to apologise to Melanie Onovo and the JCR. Alfie worried that, given Stan Szelag's public statements, this apology may not be forthcoming or, even if given, may

appear meaningless. Alfie encouraged the JCR to take steps to address this situation and apologise to Melanie Onovo.

Phil Fernandes (President) said they had been in contact with Melanie Onovo to keep Melanie updated about the steps the JCR would be taking. Phil understood Alfie's point and said they'd try to be as open as possible with the JCR's response.

### **3. Reports from Officers, Reps and Committees**

Written reports are available [here](#). The following JCR Officials were asked to give verbal reports.

#### **Academic Affairs Officer – Milo Mallaby**

Milo Mallaby (Academic Affairs Officer) said they had submitted the thematic feedback report to the College's Educational Policy Committee, who would review the findings. Milo said issues relating to Collection marking and tutorials had been raised.

Milo Mallaby noted that the Senior Tutor would be answering questions at the "town hall-style" event that evening.

#### **Domestic Officers – Ben Clinch and Wil Anderson**

Not present.

#### **Entz Officers – Tara Daemi and Danny Roade**

Not present.

#### **Env-Ethics Officer – Bridget Stuart**

Not present.

#### **Equality and Diversity Officer – Jahnavi Kalayil**

Jahnavi Kalayil (Equality and Diversity Officer) said they had been reviewing the minutes of the Extraordinary General Meeting. Jahnavi said they had been in contact with Ian Klinke (College Fellow for Equality) to discuss some longstanding issues.

#### **Welfare Officers – Maksim Richards, Grace Goodier and Suzanne Kapelus**

Grace Goodier (Welfare Officer) said the pub quizzes had been quite successful. Grace noted the Welfare Officers had also been working to operate the sexual health reimbursement scheme. Grace said some of the Welfare Officers' efforts relating to exam stress had unfortunately been less successful than planned. The Welfare Officers' were now looking towards Freshers' Week.

#### **Women's Officer – Ava Mitchell**

Not present.

**Bike Reps — Seb Towers and Hazel Weng**

Not present.

**4a. Constitutional Motions Requiring Ratification**

**b) The “Black Lives Matter” Standing Policy Motion [Vote B]**

Proposer: Phil Fernandes, President

Seconded: Ethan Joseph, Ethnic Minorities E&D Rep

The motion was **ratified nem. con.**

## 4b. Ratifications

### **Oxford SU**

Lachlann Hinley (Secretary) said that the JCR had to ratify membership of the Oxford SU annually. Lachlann said that, even if SU membership was not ratified, individual JCR members would retain membership of the SU. Lachlann encouraged members to ratify membership, so that the JCR could continue to be represented on SU platforms.

Alfie Deere-Hall asked whether the JCR's decision to end collaboration with Christ Church would affect the JCR's participation in the SU. Lachlann Hinley said that the JCR had forbidden cooperation with Christ Church JCR. Lachlann felt the SU did not constitute 'cooperation' with Christ Church, given the JCR's sole relationship was with the SU itself and Christ Church's membership of the body was incidental to this primary relationship.

Membership of the Oxford SU was **ratified nem. con.**

## Positions

### **Returning Officer (1 vacancy)**

No one stood for the position. Zara Hussain (Vice President) remained Acting Returning Officer.

### **JCR Chair (1 vacancy)**

Alfie Deere-Hall said they'd happily be chair for the meeting. Lachlann Hinley (Secretary) asked whether Alfie possessed the necessary skill-set for the particular meeting. Elaborating, Lachlann noted that a candidate for the position of Suspended Students E&D Rep had requested that their written hust should be read out in a particular way. Alfie said he was able to do an Australian accent. Alfie was ratified **nem. con.**

### **JCR Auditors for TT20 (2 vacancies)**

Talav Bhimnathwala submitted a written hust, noting they had been one of the auditors for Hilary Term 2020 and wished to use the experience to conduct the Trinity Term audit. Talav was **ratified nem. con.**

Shuichi Chiba said they had experience auditing in Trinity Term and Michaelmas Term 2019. Shuichi was **ratified nem. con.**

### **Art Rep (1 vacancy)**

Zoe Hind said they had experience being involved with the St John's Arts Week. In addition, they were a student ambassador for Modern Art Oxford gallery. Zoe was **ratified nem. con.**

### **Disabilities Equality and Diversity Rep (1 vacancy to join Alice Hackney)**

No one stood for the position.

### **International Students Equality and Diversity Rep (1 vacancy to join Michal Karlubik)**

Marco Fabus said they had one week and two days left as a member of the JCR and they, “would rather die a JCR Official than a mere pleb”. Marco wanted to join Michal, who Marco noted was a fellow Slovak.

Zara Hussain (Vice President) asked Marco Fabus about their plans for the next nine days. Marco noted they were still in College and had been baking for other students in College. Toni Busuttill said Marco’s baking had been very effective and said Marco “had been doing his job already before he was in the role”.

Marco Fabus was **ratified nem. con.**

### **Suspended Students Equality and Diversity Rep (2 vacancies)**

Alfie Deere-Hall said Yvonne Clark-Lewis had submitted a written hust. Alfie proceeded to read this in an Australian accent, as requested by Yvonne (see [written hust](#)).

Jahnavi Kalayil (Equality & Diversity Officer) asked if Yvonne Clark-Lewis still had access to her St John’s email address. Lachlann Hinley believed that she did.

Yvonne Clark-Lewis was **ratified nem. con.**

#### 4c. Termly Rep Re-Ratification

Position	Name	Re-Ratified
Bike Rep	Seb Towers	Intend to resign MT20 GM1. <b>Re-ratified</b> in the interim.
Bike Rep	Hazel Weng	Intend to resign MT20 GM1. <b>Re-ratified</b> in the interim.
Sports Rep	Felix Stocker	<p>I would very much like to continue as Sports Rep; it's been a great year, from encouraging participation in Freshers' Week and organising the Sidney Sussex sports day, to now the more prosaic business of presenting Sports Dinner and processing Blues Grants. Right now, I'm working on a boycott of CHCH sport in collaboration with sports reps from every other college, which continues to be a really valuable campaign. The year ahead has a lot to look forward to: going to Cambridge to be hosted by Sidney, the replacement sports dinner in Michaelmas, continued success on every front, a reorganisation of some administrative functions, and more as well. Milo's contributed a huge amount over the past few terms, so I hope he continues in post as well.</p> <p><b>Re-ratified</b></p>
Sports Rep	Milo Mallaby	<p>I would like to continue as sports rep as well. It has been productive working with Felix this year, and I look forward to continuing. Next year we are planning two sports dinners, another sports day, this time at Cambridge, and as he says, a Christ Church boycott. I also look forward to welcoming the new freshers into the John's sporting pantheon.</p> <p><b>Re-ratified</b></p>
Art Rep	Ollie Parkes	<p>Keen to carry on</p> <p><b>Re-ratified</b></p>
Charities Rep	Nia Evans	<p>I would like to continue as Charity Rep as I think it is a really important role and I have more ideas of charitable events that I would like to organise. I want to continue implementing the food bank scheme as well</p>

		<p>as organise larger events such as a Charity Garden Party. As a SolidariTee Rep I have previous experience in helping to organise charity events and encouraging students to donate.</p> <p><b>Re-ratified</b></p>
Charities Rep	Freya Allery	<b>Re-ratified</b>
Facilities Rep	Nia Evans	<p>I want to continue as Facilities Rep as I want to work alongside Phil to discuss ways of improving the JCR and other social spaces around college. I plan to continue listening to what fellow students want to improve in regards to these spaces.</p> <p><b>Re-ratified</b></p>
SU Rep	Emmet O’Leary	<p>It's been a rather disconcerting start to the role of SU Rep, given that I've not actually had any of the thrill of attending the grand venues for these affairs in person. It's nevertheless been a term of important and headline-hitting motions for the SU, and I'm pleased that we've continued to play our part as a JCR despite being dispersed across the globe. As we begin to return to Oxford in the wake of the crises which have emerged, it will be more important than ever that the University is held to account for its actions and their impact on students. It would be my pleasure to try to ensure every voice is heard as an SU Rep.</p> <p><b>Re-ratified</b></p>
SU Rep	Amelia Holt	<p>Graduating</p> <p><b>Re-ratified</b> in the interim.</p>
PRAT Rep	Sophie Whitehead	<p>Although PRAT will probably take a very different shape next term to what it has been in the last, if it is even possible at all, I would like to continue in my role. I hope that in the terms I have held this position I have successfully catered for a wide range of tastes and dietary needs, whilst also obviously maintaining a plentiful supply of Nr Kipling. I would like to continue to supply one of the big motivations for people attending</p>

		<p>JCR meetings even if this means adapting by picking snacks that are individually packaged or taking the time to separate out the snacks to ensure there is no cross contamination. PRAT may not even be a thing in Michaelmas, but I would like to continue in my role if it is.</p> <p><b>Re-ratified</b></p>
PRAT Rep	Dan Hubbard	<p>It's a good opportunity to get free pizza, and actually motivates me to actively go to JCR meetings</p> <p><b>Re-ratified</b></p>
Social Media Rep	Issy Stephens	<p>I would like to continue in my role as social media rep. I believe I have contributed greatly to the JCR's social media presence and would like the opportunity to continue, as I enjoy it.</p> <p><b>Re-ratified</b></p>
Social Media Rep	Astrid Ingemann Breitenstein	Graduating



## 5. Motions of Censure, No Confidence Motions and Emergency Charities Motions

### a) The “BLM - The Bail Project” Emergency Charity Motion

Proposer: Oliver Tushingam

Seconded: Ethan Joseph (Ethnic Minorities E&D Rep)

#### Relevant documents:

[Appendix 1](#) - Emergency Charities Motion Petition

#### This JCR notes that:

- a. Black lives matter.
- b. The murder of George Floyd was an injustice and the product of systemic racism.
- c. Those who have been protesting this injustice are justified in their actions.
- d. St John’s has a significant community of BME undergraduates, for whom this is a particularly distressing time.
- e. Taking action to support the Black lives matter movement affirms the anti-racist values of this JCR.
- f. The Bail Project is a fund working in the United States at the national level to bail out people arrested for protesting.
- g. The protestors do not deserve to be in prison.
- h. Bail is often set unfairly at levels beyond the means of these protestors.
- i. A petition of at least 50 JCR members has agreed this is an emergency cause.

#### This JCR believes that:

- j. We must all stand in solidarity with those protesting the death of George Floyd, and support the systemic reforms that these protests promote.
- k. This is an emergency due to substantial number of protesters recently arrested and subject to unfair and punitive bail conditions in the United States

#### This JCR therefore resolves to:

- l. Donate £290 to The Bail Project, Inc. from the JCR Emergency Charities Buffer

Oliver Tushingam said that, as a result of the ongoing protests in the United States, protestors had been arrested and were subject to cash bail conditions that they could not pay. Oliver noted that the money would come from the JCR Emergency Charities Buffer. Oliver believed this was a cause the JCR should be supporting and this had been demonstrated in the petition, which had received almost double the number of signatures required.

Ben Robinson (Treasurer) said the JCR Emergencies Charity Buffer had £290. This would be the maximum available to allocate to the motion. Oliver Tushingam agreed to Ben Robinson’s amendment to replace “£300” in clause l. with “£290”.

***Motion agreed (30 in favour, 2 against, 0 abstentions)***

## 6. Other Motions

### b) The "It Happens Here and Speak Out Oxford - Sexual Assault and Harassment" Standing Policy Motion

Proposer: Maksim Richards (Welfare Officer)

Seconded: Grace Goodier (Welfare Officer)

#### Content warning

Issues raised include sexual assault and rape

#### This JCR notes that:

- a. 62% of students at UK universities have experienced sexual violence of some sort, and 8% of female students have been raped, compared to 4% of the general female population in England and Wales (Revolt Sexual Assault Report 2018)
- b. Only 7% of students know “a lot” about their university’s sexual violence policy, and only 9% of affected students turn to student support services (Revolt Sexual Assault Report 2018)
- c. Only 6% of students who have experienced sexual assault or harassment reported their experience of sexual violence to their university (Revolt Sexual Assault Report 2018)
- d. Only 2% of students who experienced sexual violence felt both able to report it to their university and were then satisfied with the reporting process (Revolt Sexual Assault Report 2018)
- e. The University’s Sexual Harassment and Violence Support Service is advertised as a service for students who have “experienced sexual harassment and violence in any form,” but has not advertised that it also offers support and advice to accused students
- f. The Support Service aims to ensure that different advisors meet with reporting students and the accused individual, but although 56% of perpetrators are known to victims of sexual violence, that leaves 44% who are unknown, and victims have no obligation to name their attacker and therefore this cannot be guaranteed
- g. Pinset Masons’ Guidance For Higher Education Institutions states that “as far as possible, the support measures for each student should be provided separately” (<https://www.universitiesuk.ac.uk/policy-and-analysis/reports/Documents/2016/guidance-for-higher-education-institutions.pdf>)

#### This JCR believes that:

- h. That support should be available for both students who have experienced and have been accused of sexual violence
- i. That victims using the Support Service must feel believed and supported given the already chronic underreporting of sexual violence
- j. That as not all victims can name their attacker and many choose not to, the Support Service cannot ensure the same staff are not advising both victim and attacker, creating conflicts of interest and potentially causing severe distress for students involved
- k. The current joint role of the Support Service may contribute to further discouraging students from accessing vital support

**This JCR therefore resolves to:**

- l. Mandate the JCR President and General Committee sign [the open letter to the Vice-Chancellor](#) created by students, and the advocacy groups It Happens Here Oxford and SpeakOut Oxford.
- m. Mandate the JCR President and General Committee encourage and support SU consultations with the University over its sexual violence support policies, calling on the University to increase transparency, and review how it supports both victims and accused
- n. Mandate the Welfare Officers to maintain contact with the relevant SU officers on the progress of the proposed consultations, and follow up with this in Michaelmas
- o. Add items h. to k. to Standing Policy as “Beliefs” and add items l. to n. to Standing Policy as “Implementing Resolutions”

Alfie Deere-Hall noted that this motion carried a content warning and contained references to rape and sexual assault.

Maksim Richards (Welfare Officer) said that around 60% of people experience some form of sexual violence while at University, which is over 12,000 at Oxford alone. Maksim said this statistic rose to around 80% of women. Maksim said the motion tried to address the failings in reporting sexual violence and the handling of sexual violence by the University. Maksim had seen these failings directly affect victims as a consequence of Maksim’s role as Welfare Officer.

The motion would commit the JCR to sign an election, either individuals on their own behalf or through an Officer. The motion additionally encouraged Oxford SU to consult with the University.

There was a discussion over the best Officer to take the mandate in clause n. Phil Fernandes (President) suggested that the clause fell under the remit of the Welfare Officer. Grace Goodier (Welfare Officer) agreed and noted that Welfare Officers were peer support trained, which could be an asset.

Lachlann Hinley suggested amending the motion to add before clauses l. and m. “Mandate the JCR President and General Committee”, replace “To mandate the gender equality representative (or other JCR gender representative” with “Mandate the Welfare Officers” and insert a new clause p. “Add items h. to k. to Standing Policy as “Beliefs” and add items l. to n. to Standing Policy as “Implementing Resolutions”. Maksim Richards **accepted the amendment as friendly.**

Zara Hussain (Vice President) added their support to the motion and noted that Freshers’ Week would be disrupted in light of the ongoing pandemic. Zara said this was an opportunity to emphasise the importance of the issue to Oxford SU.

***Motion agreed (32 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstentions)***

### **c) The “MT20 BLM Charity Commitment” Standing Policy Motion**

Proposer: Oliver Tushingam

Seconded: Ethan Joseph (Ethnic Minorities E&D Rep)

#### **This JCR notes that:**

- a. Black lives matter.
- b. The murder of George Floyd was an injustice and the product of systemic racism.
- c. ‘Black Lives Matter’ includes all Black lives, including those of Black LGBTQ+ people, who often face disproportionate harms.
- d. Tony McDade was a Black trans man who was unjustly killed by police, and misgendered in subsequent police statements. His killer remains free.
- e. St John’s has a significant community of BME undergraduates.
- f. Taking action to support the Black lives matter movement affirms the anti-racist values of this JCR.
- g. We are unable to give more than £300 to this cause this term, due to the restrictions of the JCR constitution and the budget available.
- h. In Michaelmas, considerably more money will become available to be given to charities.
- i. The fight against racism and anti-blackness is continuous.
- j. The Movement For Black Lives (M4BL) is a leading US organisation mobilizing for racial justice in the US, and a leading organiser of the ongoing protests in America.
- k. The Freedom Fund is a Black-led organisation dedicated to tackling the over-incarceration of LGBTQ people in the United States, and securing their freedom.
- l. The Runnymede Trust is an independent British race equality think tank and charity, dedicated to overcoming racial inequality and injustice in the UK.

#### **This JCR believes that:**

- m. The JCR must do what it can to contribute to the dismantling of systemic racism at home and abroad.

#### **This JCR therefore resolves to:**

- n. Mandate the JCR President and General Committee to do their best to ensure that each of the following successfully receive £300 from the Charities Budget in MT20, if necessary by scaling down other charities through amendment:
  - i. The Movement For Black Lives
  - ii. Freedom Fund Network, Inc.
  - iii. The Runnymede Trust
- o. Mandate the JCR Charities Reps and General Committee to make members aware of this when advertising the Michaelmas Charities Meeting.
- p. Add items n. and o. to Standing Policy as an Implementing Resolution

Oliver Tushingam<sup>1</sup> noted that the Emergency Charities Motion had a cap of £290, due to the limitations of the JCR Emergency Charities Buffer. Oliver said the JCR should support the causes more generally and noted that this motion would facilitate the JCR donating to

---

<sup>1</sup> *Oliver was serenaded by a chorus of birdsong*

the named charities next term, when the JCR received more money. One of the charities is UK focussed, whilst the other two are US based.

Ethan Joseph (Ethnic Minorities E&D Rep) agreed with Oliver Tushingam and said the causes addressed some of the wider issues behind the protests. Ethan spoke specifically about the work of the named charities:

- q. Movement For Black Lives (M4BL) were heavily involved with the current protests. These protests appear to be achieving real change.
- r. The Freedom Fund recognises the intersectionality of black identity.
- s. The Runnymede Trust is a UK based charity. Ethan said it was important to institutionalise anti-racism, especially within an academic setting, to achieve long-term change.

Zara Hussain (Vice President) asked how much money was in the Michaelmas 2021 charities budget and what the average allocation for charities was. Ben Robinson (Treasurer) said the exact budget would not be clear until College make a payment halfway through Michaelmas, although charities usually receive £300 (the maximum) or close to £300.

Lachlann Hinley (Secretary) read out a question that had been pre-submitted by someone unable to attend the meeting in person. The question asked whether the motion attempted to mandate the Committee to bring a charities motion to the Michaelmas charities meeting or tried to serve as a preemptive charities motion in its own right.

Oliver Tushingam said the motion would not bind the JCR into passing the charities motions in Michaelmas and, instead, mandated the JCR General Committee to try and encourage the JCR into agreeing with the charities motion, even at the expense (through an amendment scaling down allocations) of other charities motions submitted that term. Oliver said any member could still propose alternate causes.

Marie Davidsen Buhl noted that the motion both ensured the named charities received an allocation in Michaelmas and ensured they received either the same allocation as other charities or a greater allocation. Marie asked why the motion was necessary right now, instead of being proposed in Michaelmas, as with other causes.

In response, Ethan Joseph said, although the issue would not go away, the amount JCR members care might decline. Ethan added that it was impossible to guess the issues occupying members' minds in Michaelmas. Ethan did not have the confidence that everyone would have the same level of interest in issues of racism next term, following a spike in interest after recent events. Ethan said it was important to have the current enthusiasm written into Standing Policy.

Oliver Tushingam noted that the motion would shift the burden of action onto the JCR President and General Committee. Oliver Tushingam said the motion also reflected the fact that the JCR lacked the current charities budget to allocate money this term.

Marie Davidsen Buhl understood the importance of giving money to the causes named in the motion. Marie said the JCR needed to consider whether freshers could be excluded from the democratic decision-making process in Michaelmas. Marie also said the JCR needed to consider the adequacy of the current charities procedure where causes were

approved without much comparative consideration, that impacted the overall funds each charity received. In response, Oliver Tushingham said that freshers would both have the opportunity to put forward causes in Michaelmas and, subsequently, in Hilary and Trinity 2021.

Lachlann Hinley (Secretary) noted that one of the issues with the current charities budget was that College had failed to transfer the money collected from the Charities Levy.

Phil Fernandes (President) was concerned that the mandate on the JCR President and General Committee to “ensure” charities motions were passed overstated their power. Phil noted that neither the President or General Committee could force members to vote a certain way.

Zara Hussain (Vice President) proposed that “ensure” (in clause n.) be replaced with “do their best to ensure”. Oliver Tushingham **accepted this amendment as friendly.**

***Motion agreed (23 in favour, 8 against, 1 abstention)***

## **8. Any Other Business**

### **Standing Policy (Lachlann Hinley)**

[Appendix 2](#) - Expired Standing Policy

Lachlann Hinley (Secretary) noted that the specific Standing Policy item mandated the JCR President and Environment & Ethics Officer to investigate the quarry being developed on College land in Warwickshire. Lachlann said the item had expired and was being removed.

Phil Fernandes (President) said there had been a planning hearing earlier in June and there had been no updates since.

### **Thanks**

Zara Hussain (Vice President) thanked the finalists present for attending their final JCR meeting, especially Marco for being ratified as International Students E&D Rep.